II mention the name Pamir, although he tried on "Pamir as such has been unknown in Khokand I— the name from the Kirghiz or other inhabitants considering that these travellers must have heard sources, and I daresay if the Pamir had figured f who crossed the valleys of the Pamilo (Pamir) I is called Pamier; the same is noticed by Bene-
the Chinese pilgrims Hwui Seng and Sung Yun, "travellers and writers. It is first mentioned by :
I as is assumed by the Russian writer in his
conquests extended in all directions, may havel'i
upon which I beg leave to make a few remarks.
valuable from the point of view of
nOItring the Pamir, has compelled the Governor-
Pamirs by stating that the restless spirit of
endeavour to prove the innucence and harmless-
vowment of Colonel Yonoff's expedition to the
which might easily murder public opinion and
October 20 on the above question, although
spoDdent which you publish in yoar issue of
It is over and over again the old story of the "
the poor Kirghiz subjects, whose flocks are grazing
Tsar was, so to say, called for in protection of
poor Russian wolf on the upper course of the
Khokand, and that from the earliest titnes,
population, the Pamir, as well as all the mountain
passes and defiles of the Sarighol and Kashgar
mountains, always belonged and were governed from Kho-
To show how undeniable such an assertion is, I must begin by alluding to the
rather curious fact that the name Pamir, as a
geographical denomination, is utterly unknown
historical records exist. Baer, who was well
served in the geography of his country, does not
more astonishing, that name does not even occur
in any of the

THE RUSSIAN STATEMENT OF THE PAMIR QUESTION.
Sir,—The letter of your St. Petersburg Correspond-
ence that appeared in your issue of October 20 on the same question, although
valuably from the point of view of our information, contains, nevertheless, sundry statements which might easily produce a false impression upon which I beg leave to make a few remarks. The tendency of the said letter is, of course, to find a plea for the severest activity of the Rus-
sian military authorities in Turkestan, and to endeavour to prove the innocuous and harmless-
ness of Colonel Yonoff's expedition to the
as such having been unknown in Khokand. I—
the name from the Kirghiz or other inhabitants
considering that these travellers must have heard
sources, and I daresay if the Pamir had figured
f who crossed the valleys of the Pamilo (Pamir)
in the valleys of the "Roof of the World." It is
ever and over again the old story of the poor
Russian wolf on the upper course of the
Khokand, and that from the earliest times,
the Khokand, which bears the title "Dad-khah"
(Dad-khah means judge, and was a rank of
importance among the inhabitants of Khokand)
in Khokand."
The author of this book, M. W.
Nal'kun, a Central Asian by extraction, has
based his work upon various, mostly Oriental,
and of the Oxyrhynchus are given in great detail and minute-
less without one single mention of the name of
Pamir. I have looked through various other
Oriental manuscripts relating to the geography of Central Asia, with the best of my
knowledge, I can find no one that mentions a geographical
geographical definition, and, what is still more astonishing, that name does not even occur
in a recently-published historical work on the
Khanate of Khokand, which bears the title "Krasnaya Istoriya Khokandskago Khanstva" by Gl.
Karan, 1886. ("A Short History of the Khanate of
Khokand,"). The author of this book, M. W.
Nal'kun, a Central Asian by extraction, has
based his work upon various, mostly Oriental,
and Chinese sources, and I do not if the Pamir has been
mentioned so many species of fauna (particularly
in the autumn of 1841, Colonel Yonoff would not speak of grassy plains and
journey from the Alichur to Khokand in 20 days,
in spite of the advanced season—namely, the
middle of September. I see there is a prevalent
view in England about the absolute unimport-
ance of the Pamir, as proved by the letter of
October 17; but your gallant correspondent
would certainly alter his views if he would
examine the papers published by Russians on
this matter. Their extreme anxiety in concealing
their plans is the best and most valid reason for
our watchfulness.
I beg to remain yours obediently,
A. VAMBERY.
Bangalore University, Oct. 26.
THE NATIONAL BOARD OF EDUCATION,
A.D. 518. Marco Polo speaks of a plain which is called Pamier; the same is noticed by Bene-

dict G.-S., who travelled there in 1603, and, con-

sidering that these travellers must have heard

the name from the Kirghiz or other inhabitants

of the Pamir, it is easily explainable that the

Pamirs such has been unknown in Khokand

and in Khwarez.^ Now I beg leave to ask whether a geographi-

cal, undefined and unknown region could ever have elicited such an amount of attention and import-

ance among the inhabitants of Khokand as is assumed by the Russian writer in his paper published in the semi-official part of the central Turkestan v. Simply not. I was travelling with Khokandians for months, I

meet with the name of the Pamir, and when speaking of the south of their country they always used the vague expression Atai-taglar (Other Mountains). It is under this name that Muddal (Hememud Ali), the greatest ruler of modern Khokand, from 1811 to 1822, whose conquests extended in all directions, may have laid claim occasionally to certain portions of the tableland in order to have a control over the Kipchaks and other branches of the

Kirghiz and to attack the Chinese, with whom he was frequently at war; but the list of Banikhas (Bad-ubah means judge, and was a rank and the name in Khokand) given by the Russian writer as

men who have ruled over the Pamir is a very pro-

blematic evidence with regard to the de facto

possession of it by the Russian government, and consequently Russia's right of inheritance is very doubtful

indeed.

I am sorry to say I cannot come to a better

result with regard to the so-called sacred duty of

the Kara-Kirghiz to protect his beloved and dear Kirghiz

subjects against the robberies of the Afghan.

The question as to which clans and branches of the

Kara-Kirghiz are subjects of the Tzar, and as to when they became his subjects, cannot be

authoritatively answered as it is generally import-

ant. It must be borne in mind that the Kara-Kirghiz (i.e., black Kirghiz), or Horus as they are

informally called, are comparatively new-comers in Central Asia. They have migrated from the

banks of the Yenissei to the mountainous

district lying between Semirechensk and the

western spurs of the Thien-Shan. West-

ward their migrations extend to the water-

shed of the rivers Tchatal and Talay; east-

ward they frequent the valleys of the Thien-

Shan far into the possessions of China; whilst

in the south they are to be met with as far as

Shah, on the road between Leb and Yar-

kand. Their main divisions are the Ong (right

wing) and Sol (left wing), of which the former

migrates on Russian territory, while the latter are to be met with in the

northern frontier district of China. As

with every nomadic people, so also with the

Kara-Kirghiz, it is extremely difficult to fix a

distinct limitation to the sphere of their wander-

ings, and, consequently, to the character of their

alliance. This uncertainty was the cause of

many quarrels and disputes between Russia and

China, and even at the present time the ques-

tion of authority over various branches of these

nomads is unsettled. There is no doubt that

certain portions of the Pamirs are frequented

by Kirghiz coming from the Atai-i.e., Russian

subject-also; but, on the other hand, it is patent

that some of the Kirghiz subject to China has-

wise resort to the said high tableland, and the

right or duty of the Russias to protect their

subjects appears in the same degree also to

China. Of course, at present, when the question

of authority over possession of the Pamis is on

the table, the Russians are inclined to claim

authority over all Kara-Kirghiz, but a few

years ago this was not the case, for Russian authori-
ties like Zagriashski, Radloff, and many oth-
er officials, even during the last 28 (2) years

uninterruptedly scientific and military expeditions to the dreary "Roof of the World." If the Russian writer comprehends England with

having constantly incessantly the Pamis with Eng-

land, it is evident that the word Pamir, or in its

plural the Pamirs, meaning literally, like chief

or great, a plain, a fertile and a district, becomes

forever clear that the word of the long list of Russian

travellers from Fedtchenko to Grombtcheffski can

hardly be compared with the modest achievement of

the four or five Englishmen who have visited the

Pamirs. An intentional disfiguring of facts will

not help in discarding doubtful points, and in

summing up our scanty notices about the Pamirs

we may state-(1) that the word Pamir, or in its

plural the Pamirs, meaning literally, like chief

or great, a plain, a fertile and a district, is nowhere

in use in Central Asia as the geographical

name, but for the mountainous district between

the rivers Talas and Tchatala. (2) That it was never included in the four or five Englishmen

who have visited the Pamirs. (3) That it has never exceeded the present one, except in the neigh-

bouring provinces or principalities, where in

times more numerous the settled population must

have been much more numerous than the presen-

tone; (3) that the physical character of the lea-